

Métricas de Calidad Interna y Externa para Servicios Cloud: Un Mapeo Sistemático

Ximena Guerrón^{1,2}, Silvia Abrahão², Emilio Insfran²

¹Universidad Central del Ecuador, Avenida Universitaria s/n, 170129, Quito, Ecuador

²Universitat Politècnica de València, Camino de Vera, s/n, 46022, Valencia, España

xguerron@uce.edu.ec, xigesan@doctor.upv.es,
{sabrahao,einsfran}@dsic.upv.es

Apéndice 1. Clasificación de las métricas de calidad encontradas en el mapeo sistemático

Leyenda		Posibles respuestas para cada criterio de extracción														
Criterios de Extracción de datos																
Característica		AF = Adecuación Funcional, ED = Eficiencia de desempeño, CO = Compatibilidad, US = Usabilidad, FI =Fiabilidad, SE =Seguridad, MA = Mantenibilidad, PO = Portabilidad														
Métrica		Nombre de la métrica														
Fase del ciclo de vida		Req. = Requisitos, Adq. =Adquisición, Des. = Desarrollo, Int = Integración, Ope. = Operación , Ret = Retiro														
Artefacto de software		Esp. = Especificación del servicio cloud, Arq. = Arquitectura del servicio cloud, Ser. =Servicio cloud														
Tipo de servicio		SaaS= Software como servicio, PaaS = Plataforma como servicio, IaaS= Infraestructura como servicio														
Punto de vista		CSP = Proveedor del servicio, CSC = Consumidor del servicio, CSF = Facilitador del servicio, CSD = Desarrollador del servicio, CF= Cliente final														
Procedimiento de validación		A.A. = Aproximación axiomática, A.T.M = Aproximación basada en la Teoría de la Medición,C.E. = Caso de estudio, E. = Encuesta, E.C. = Experimento Controlado, N.V. = No validada, P.C. = Prueba de concepto														

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida			Artefacto software			Tipo de Servicio			Punto de vista			Procedimiento de validación			Ref. Artículo				
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da
AF	Accuracy	Accuracy frequency(φs)		x							x	x		x		x					x	S21
AF	Accuracy	Pertinence value(πs)		x						x	x		x		x						x	S21
AF	Accuracy	Accuracy frequency	x							x		x		x		x					x	S17
AF	Accuracy	Suitability of non-essential features	x						x		x		x		x		x				x	S17
AF	Accuracy	Accuracy expected			x				x		x	x		x		x					x	S47
AF	Accuracy	Accuracy value	x						x		x		x		x		x				x	S17
AF	Capacity	Computing Capacity of the Resource		x					x		x		x		x						x	S47
AF	Capacity	Total Completeness		x				x		x	x		x		x						x	S47
AF	Capacity	Defects/CS		x				x		x	x		x		x						x	S47
AF	Consistency	Consistency Across Several Instances	x	x					x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	S50	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo			
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.													
ED	Capacity	Change in Load Balancing(ΔLB)			x						x	x		x						x	s47	
ED	Capacity	System overhead rate(SOR)			x						x		x	x						x	s56	
ED	Capacity	Rejection probability(RJ) Disk input output (I/O) performance			x						x		x					x		x	s56	
ED	Capacity	Memory performance	x								x		x		x		x			x	s60	
ED	Capacity	CPU		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	CPU Frequency		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	RAM size		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Storage size		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Replication		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Storage device capacity		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Permissible storage changes to increased workloads		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Number of replicas		x	x					x	x		x	x		x	x			x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Application capacity		x	x					x	x	x				x	x	x		x	s75	
ED	Capacity	Disk read			x						x		x	x						x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Disk write			x						x		x	x						x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Load average			x						x		x	x						x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Flow out			x						x		x	x						x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Flow in			x						x		x	x						x	s70	
ED	Capacity	TCP connections	x	x	x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Total processes number			x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Monitored process number	x		x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	New connections		x	x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Packets in			x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Packets out			x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Active connections			x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	Inactive connections			x						x		x	x		x				x	s70	
ED	Capacity	rx_bytes			x						x	x	x	x		x				x	s76	
ED	Capacity	rx_packets			x						x	x	x	x		x				x	s76	
ED	Capacity	tx_bytes			x						x	x	x	x		x				x	s76	

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software			Tipo de Servicio			Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación					
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da				
												A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.								
ED	Capacity	tx_packets						x		x	x	x	x	x	x							x	S76			
ED	Capacity	Efficiency			x			x				x	x	x	x	x	x				x		S71			
ED	Capacity	Storage Capacity						x				x				x	x	x				x		S71		
ED	Capacity	Content						x				x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S74		
ED	Capacity	Capacity minimum	x				x					x			x	x	x	x				x		S82		
ED	Capacity	Capacity provisioned	x				x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S82		
ED	Capacity	Excess capacity	x				x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S82		
ED	Capacity	Shortage capacity	x				x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S82		
ED	Capacity	Agility mantained	x				x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S82		
ED	Capacity	CPU capacity					x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S78		
ED	Capacity	Memory capacity					x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S78		
ED	Capacity	Storage capacity					x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S78		
ED	Capacity	Bandwidth capacity					x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S78		
ED	Capacity	Group of Pictures (GOP)		x			x					x		x		x	x	x	x			x		S80		
ED	Capacity	Capacity					x					x		x		x	x	x	x					S87		
ED	Fineness	Impact energy (E)					x					x		x		x			x			x		S59		
ED	Fineness	Impact power(P)					x					x		x		x			x			x		S59		
ED	Fineness	Fineness of multiplexing(F)					x					x		x		x			x			x		S59		
ED	Latency	Buffer Access Latency (BAL)					x					x		x		x			x	x			x		S14	
ED	Resource utilization	Efficiency of a service provider(Eapp)	x	x								x		x		x		x	x				x	S05		
ED	Resource utilization	Storage cost					x					x		x		x	x	x	x				x	S07		
ED	Resource utilization	Utilization	x	x								x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S08		
ED	Resource utilization	System efficiency	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S17		
ED	Resource utilization	Data communication	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S17		
ED	Resource utilization	Storage	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S17		
ED	Resource utilization	Compute usage	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S17		
ED	Resource utilization	SLA violation(SLAV)					x					x		x		x		x	x				x	S18		
ED	Resource utilization	Performance Degradation due to Migrations (PDM)					x					x		x		x		x	x				x	S18		
ED	Resource utilization	Turnaround efficiency (TE)					x					x		x	x	x	x		x			x		S19		
ED	Resource utilization	Energy Cost(P)	x									x		x	x		x		x			x		S21		
ED	Resource utilization	Average number of queries		x								x		x					x			x		S23		
ED	Resource utilization	Power consumed by the CPU	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S25		
ED	Resource utilization	Total energy consumption(E)	x									x		x		x		x			x		x	S25		

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida								Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo		
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.		SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.														
ED	Resource utilization	Energy efficiency at node level for IaaS providers								x		x		x		x		x				x	S27
ED	Resource utilization	Energy efficiency at infrastructure level for IaaS providers								x		x		x		x		x				x	S27
ED	Resource utilization	Energy efficiency at VM level for IaaS providers								x		x		x		x		x				x	S27
ED	Resource utilization	Energy efficiency at service level for SaaS providers								x		x	x					x				x	S27
ED	Resource utilization	Resource Utilization(U)								x		x		x	x			x				x	S28
ED	Resource utilization	Service use rate								x		x	x				x	x				x	S29
ED	Resource utilization	Mean queue length (MQL)								x		x		x	x							x	S30
ED	Resource utilization	Packet loss probability								x		x		x	x							x	S31
ED	Resource utilization	Resource Utilization (RU)	x									x	x			x						x	S32
ED	Resource utilization	Efficiency	x									x	x			x						x	S32
ED	Resource utilization	Overall Efficiency(eff)	x	x								x	x			x	x					x	S33
ED	Resource utilization	Mean Number of requests(q)		x								x		x				x		x		x	S35
ED	Resource utilization	Actual unavailability time of the CPU(CPU_unavailable)								x		x		x	x			x				x	S37
ED	Resource utilization	Utilization of Resource (UoR)								x		x	x			x						x	S38
ED	Resource utilization	Efficiency of a service								x		x	x			x						x	S38
ED	Resource utilization	Video Quality Score(VQS)								x		x	x					x				x	S46
ED	Resource utilization	Quality shifting frequency(QSF)								x		x	x					x				x	S46
ED	Resource utilization	Mean buffering duration (MBD)								x		x	x					x				x	S46
ED	Resource utilization	Re-buffering frequency (RBF)								x		x	x					x				x	S46
ED	Resource utilization	Database Backup for every CS								x		x	x			x						x	S47
ED	Resource utilization	User Self Service Rate								x		x		x		x						x	S47
ED	Resource utilization	Performance-Cost Normalization (PCN)	x	x								x		x		x	x					x	S50
ED	Resource utilization	Performance (P)	x	x								x		x		x	x					x	S50
ED	Resource utilization	Total Cost(C)	x	x								x		x		x	x					x	S50
ED	Resource utilization	Energy consumption(E)								x		x		x	x		x					x	S55
ED	Resource utilization	Cost(C)								x		x		x	x		x					x	S55
ED	Resource utilization	Utility of performance for request(Pi)								x		x		x	x		x					x	S55

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio		Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación						Ref. Artículo	
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da		
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.															
ED	Resource utilization	Utilization							x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s58		
ED	Resource utilization	Variability through relative standard deviation (RSD)		x								x		x				x				x	s60	
ED	Resource utilization	Permissible changes to increased workloads		x	x					x	x			x	x		x	x			x	s75		
ED	Resource utilization	Permissible capacity fluctuations to workloads		x	x			x	x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s75		
ED	Resource utilization	CPU utilization			x							x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s70		
ED	Resource utilization	Disk utilization			x							x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s70		
ED	Resource utilization	Memory utilization			x							x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s70		
ED	Resource utilization	Connections utilization		x	x					x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s70		
ED	Resource utilization	performance VM			x							x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s77		
ED	Resource utilization	Effective arrival			x							x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s77		
ED	Resource utilization	cpu_usage			x				x	x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	memory_usage			x				x	x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	blkio_io_bytes_read			x				x	x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	blkio_io_bytes_write			x				x	x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	cpuUsedPercent			x				x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	memUsed			x				x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	memUsedPercent			x				x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	diskFree			x				x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	diskUsed			x				x	x			x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s76		
ED	Resource utilization	Power Demand			x					x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s71		
ED	Resource utilization	Content_cc			x				x	x		x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s74		
ED	Resource utilization	resource allocation			x				x	x	x	x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s65		
ED	Resource utilization	Average Energy Consumption per Request (AECP <i>R</i>)			x			x		x	x			x		x	x	x	x		x	s69		
ED	Resource utilization	Energy efficiency	x	x			x			x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s66		
ED	Resource utilization	Power		x			x			x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Density VM			x			x			x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Density App			x			x			x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Density User			x			x		x	x	x		x		x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Variability			x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Latency			x			x		x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s82		
ED	Resource utilization	Total Energy consumption			x			x		x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s83		
ED	Resource utilization	VM Migrations			x			x		x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s83		
ED	Resource utilization	Resource Utilization			x			x		x		x		x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s83		
ED	Scalability	Throughput			x			x	x	x	x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	s81		

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio		Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación						Ref. Artículo	
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida-dada				
																				A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.
ED	Scalability	Capacity ratio					X	X				X	X	X											x	S81
ED	Scalability	Number of tenants		X	X			X				X	X	X											x	S81
ED	Time behaviour	Performance utility function						X				X			X	X									x	S03
ED	Time behaviour	Data centre metric		X	X							X			X		X	X							x	S05
ED	Time behaviour	Number of data centres		X	X							X			X		X	X							x	S05
		Distance between location of data centre and expected service location											X			X		X	X						x	S05
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time		X	X							X			X		X	X							x	S05
ED	Time behaviour	Data Transfer Time								X		X			X	X			X						x	S07
ED	Time behaviour	Execution Time								X		X			X	X			X						x	S07
ED	Time behaviour	Expected Service Time (S)		X	X							X			X	X		X	X						x	S08
ED	Time behaviour	Availability at time t (A(t))		X	X							X			X	X		X	X						x	S08
ED	Time behaviour	Instant service probability at time t (I(t))		X	X							X			X	X		X	X						x	S08
ED	Time behaviour	Waiting time(W)		X	X							X			X	X		X	X						x	S08
ED	Time behaviour	Jitter					X				X			X	X										x	S10
ED	Time behaviour	Delay					X				X			X	X										x	S10
ED	Time behaviour	Weight by user's preference					X				X			X	X				X						x	S11
ED	Time behaviour	Recommended Service Response Time(RSRT)				X						X			X	X		X	X						x	S12
ED	Time behaviour	Execution time					X					X			X	X				X					x	S13
ED	Time behaviour	Time delay(Tws)					X					X			X	X				X					x	S16
ED	Time behaviour	Average Response Time		X								X			X			X							x	S17
ED	Time behaviour	Maximum Response Time		X								X			X			X							x	S17
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time Failure		X								X			X			X							x	S17
ED	Time behaviour	SLA Violation Time per Active Host (SLATAH)				X						X			X	X			X	X					x	S18
ED	Time behaviour	Execution Time (Treq.sex)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Latency(l)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Average Response Time(Tavg)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Maximum Response Time(Tmax)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time Failure(σrep)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time(Trep)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput(β)		X								X			X	X		X	X						x	S21
ED	Time behaviour	Main Loop Iteration Time (MLIT)		X	X							X			X	X	X	X						x	S22	
ED	Time behaviour	Time Spent with Physics (TSP)		X	X							X			X	X	X	X						x	S22	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo			
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.													
ED	Time behaviour	Time Spent with Rendering (TSR)	x	x					x		x	x	x	x	x		x		x	x	s22	
ED	Time behaviour	Response time	x							x	x						x		x	x	s23	
ED	Time behaviour	Response time			x					x	x		x				x		x	x	s26	
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time(R)			x				x		x		x	x			x		x	x	s28	
ED	Time behaviour	Response time			x				x	x					x	x			x	x	s29	
ED	Time behaviour	Jitter			x				x		x		x	x						x	s31	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay			x				x		x		x	x					x	x	s31	
ED	Time behaviour	Time Behaviour (TB)	x							x	x		x			x			x	x	s32	
ED	Time behaviour	Response time efficiency of a SaaS provider(rtEff)	x	x						x	x		x	x			x		x	x	s33	
ED	Time behaviour	Mean response time(r)		x						x	x		x			x		x	x	x	s35	
ED	Time behaviour	Behavior of Time (BoT)			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s38	
ED	Time behaviour	Jitter(J)			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s39	
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s39	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s39	
ED	Time behaviour	Ending Time(Te)			x				x		x	x				x			x	x	s40	
ED	Time behaviour	Gap Time(Tg)			x				x		x	x				x			x	x	s40	
ED	Time behaviour	Interval Time (Ti)			x				x		x	x				x			x	x	s40	
ED	Time behaviour	Preparing Time(Tp)			x				x		x	x				x			x	x	s40	
ED	Time behaviour	Transcoding Jitter Probability(ϵ)			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s41	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay			x				x		x	x		x			x		x	x	s45	
ED	Time behaviour	Initial Buffering Time (IBT)			x				x		x	x				x			x	x	s46	
ED	Time behaviour	Latency			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	No. of commits per second			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	MB per second			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	No. of new orders per second			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	No. of actions per minute			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	No. of accesses per second			x				x		x	x		x			x			x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	Persistence			x				x		x	x		x	x					x	s47	
ED	Time behaviour	Service performance utility	x						x		x	x		x	x		x			x	s48	
ED	Time behaviour	Time slot utility function	x						x		x	x		x	x		x			x	s48	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio		Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación						Ref. Artículo
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da			
												A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.							
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time										X		X		X							x	S49	
ED	Time behaviour	User rating										X	X	X	X								x	S51	
ED	Time behaviour	Gaming Response Time(RT)										X	X										x	S53	
ED	Time behaviour	Round-trip reaction delay (RTRD)										X		X									x	S54	
ED	Time behaviour	Waiting time(T)										X		X		X	X		X				x	S55	
ED	Time behaviour	Expected Request completion time(E(RCT))										X		X		X			X				x	S56	
ED	Time behaviour	SLA response time										X		X		X	X		X				x	S57	
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time										X		X	X	X	X		X				x	S58	
ED	Time behaviour	The percentile of response time										X		X	X	X	X		X				x	S58	
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput										X		X	X	X	X		X				x	S58	
ED	Time behaviour	CPU performance										X		X		X			X				x	S60	
ED	Time behaviour	Mean Response time (MRT)										X		X		X			X				x	S60	
ED	Time behaviour	Provisioning time										X		X		X			X				x	S60	
ED	Time behaviour	Instance mean starting time										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Instance standard deviation start-ing time										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Response mean time (synchronous operation)										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Response standard deviation time (synchronous operation)										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Completion mean time (asynchro-nous task)										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Completion standard deviation time (asynchronous task)										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Bandwidth										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	throughput										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay										X	X		X	X		X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	jitter										X	X					X	X				x	S75	
ED	Time behaviour	IOPS					X					X		X		X	X		X				x	S70	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay Time										X		X		X	X		X				x	S70	
ED	Time behaviour	performance										X		X		X	X						x	S77	
ED	Time behaviour	service time of the task										X		X		X	X						x	S77	

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio		Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación						Ref. Artículo
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida-dada			
												A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.							
ED	Time behaviour	Conference start time								x		x	x	x				x						x	S65
ED	Time behaviour	Participant joining time								x		x	x	x				x						x	S65
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time								x			x	x				x		x				x	S69
ED	Time behaviour	Workload arrival rate								x			x	x				x		x				x	S69
ED	Time behaviour	Average Response time	x	x						x			x		x	x		x						x	S66
ED	Time behaviour	Response time		x						x			x		x	x		x		x				x	S82
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput		x						x			x		x	x		x		x				x	S82
ED	Time behaviour	Service Response time	x	x						x			x	x				x		x				x	S79
ED	Time behaviour	data center metric	x	x						x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S78
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time								x			x		x	x		x		x				x	S78
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput service provider								x			x		x	x		x		x				x	S78
ED	Time behaviour	efficiency								x			x		x	x		x		x				x	S78
ED	Time behaviour	Latency								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	Delta	x							x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	Jitter								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	Skew	x							x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	BandWidth	x							x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	StreamEye	x							x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S80	
ED	Time behaviour	Response time	x							x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S85	
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput	x							x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S85	
ED	Time behaviour	Delay time								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S84	
ED	Time behaviour	Response Time								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S87	
ED	Time behaviour	Latency								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S87	
ED	Time behaviour	Service Response time								x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S73	
ED	Time behaviour	Throughput								x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S73	
ED	Turnaround Efficiency	Turnaround efficiency of a resource Rk (TE)								x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S36	
ED		Internet Accessibility Radio (IA)								x			x	x				x						x	S47
ED		correlation performance security								x			x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S77	
CO	Interoperability	Interoperability	x							x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x				x	S85	
CO	Interoperability	Interoperability	x							x			x		x			x					x	S17	
CO		Service Modularity(SM)								x			x	x				x					x	S38	
CO	Interoperability	Service Interoperability(SF)								x			x	x				x					x	S38	
CO		Composability								x			x	x				x					x	S38	
CO		User rating								x			x	x	x	x	x		x				x	S51	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida								Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo		
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da	
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.														
US	Installability	Average time experienced by the previous users to install		x								x		x		x	x				x	s17	
US	Learnability	Average time experienced by the previous users to learn		x								x		x		x	x				x	s17	
US	Learnability	Usability	x	x		x						x		x	x		x				x	s66	
US	Understandability	Average time experienced by the previous users to understand		x								x		x		x					x	s17	
US	Usability	Usability		x		x						x	x			x		x			x	s79	
US	Operability	Average time experienced by the previous users to operate		x								x		x		x	x				x	s17	
US		Learnability			x							x	x			x						x	s47
US	Operability	Success ratio			x							x	x			x						x	s47
US		User rating			x							x	x	x	x			x			x		s51
US		Usability (USAB-CQ)		x	x							x	x	x	x	x			x	x		x	s61
US		Usability (USAB)		x	x							x	x	x	x	x			x	x		x	s62
FI	Availability	Availability(Av)			x							x	x	x	x	x		x			x		s04
FI	Availability	Availability % up to Nth minute			x							x		x	x							x	s06
FI	Availability	Availability of the Composite Service C up to Nth minute			x							x		x	x							x	s06
FI	Availability	Availability			x							x	x			x		x			x		s09
FI	Availability	Availability(Av)		x								x	x			x		x			x		s21
FI	Availability	Availability of resource Rk(AV)		x								x	x	x	x	x		x			x		s36
FI	Availability	Downtime			x							x	x			x					x		s09
FI	Availability	Availability (AVAL-CQ)			x							x	x	x				x			x		s61
FI	Availability	Availability (AVAL)			x							x	x	x				x			x		s62
FI	Availability	Uptime percentage			x							x	x	x	x			x			x		s63
FI	Availability	Percentage of service uptime		x	x							x	x	x		x	x	x	x		x		s75
FI	Availability	Duration of a single outage		x	x							x	x	x		x	x	x	x		x		s75
FI	Availability	VM available probability			x							x		x	x			x			x		s77
FI	Availability	security metric			x							x		x	x			x			x		s77
FI	Availability	Uptime			x							x		x	x		x			x		x	s67
FI	Availability	Uptime percentage			x							x		x	x		x			x		x	s71
FI	Availability	Availability			x							x		x	x		x			x		x	s74
FI	Availability	Availability	x	x								x		x	x		x			x		x	s66
FI	Availability	Availability		x								x		x	x		x			x		x	s82
FI	Availability	Availability	x	x								x		x	x		x			x		x	s79
FI	Availability	Availability	x	x								x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	s78	

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo			
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida-dada
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.													
FI	Resiliency	Recovery time(Trec)		x	x						x		x	x		x	x				x	S08
FI	Resiliency	Maximum performance loss(MPL)		x	x						x		x	x		x	x				x	S08
FI	Robustness	Robustness(Rob)		x							x	x			x		x				x	S21
FI	Time behaviour	Reliability state				x					x			x	x						x	S74
FI		Accuracy of service(AoS)				x					x	x			x						x	S38
FI		Availability Efficiency of a SaaS provider (avEff)	x	x							x	x			x	x					x	S33
FI	Availability	Availability rate			x						x		x		x	x		x			x	S07
FI		Completeness of variant set(CoM)			x						x	x			x						x	S38
FI		Dependability(Ds)	x								x	x		x						x	x	S42
FI		Flexibility of service(FOS)			x						x	x			x						x	S38
FI		Mean Number of PMs in active mode(Npm)			x						x			x	x						x	S44
FI		Ratio of available VMs to accepted VM requests(Rava)			x						x		x		x	x					x	S44
FI		Reliability Efficiency of a SaaS provider (rlEff)	x	x							x	x			x	x					x	S33
FI		Settling Time (Tset)			x						x		x		x			x			x	S20
FI		Peak Overshoot or Undershoot (PO)			x						x		x		x			x			x	S20
FI		Peak Time (Tpeak)			x						x		x		x			x			x	S20
FI		Percentile Time (Tpercentile)			x						x		x		x			x			x	S20
FI		Response time				x					x	x			x			x			x	S38
FI		Robustness of Service(ROS)	x								x	x			x						x	S32
FI	Availability	Availability(A)	x	x							x		x		x	x		x	x		x	S08
FI	Availability	Availability(Aws)			x						x	x						x			x	S16
FI	Availability	Availability	x								x		x		x			x			x	S17
FI	Availability	Availability(AV)			x						x	x	x	x				x			x	S19
FI	Availability	Service Availability	x								x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x		x	S24
FI	Availability	Availability			x						x	x					x	x		x	x	S29
FI	Availability	Availability of web service			x						x	x				x					x	S38
FI	Availability	Availability			x						x		x	x			x				x	S47
FI	Availability	Service availability		x							x	x		x	x			x			x	S48
FI	Availability	Availability (Av)	x	x							x	x	x	x			x	x			x	S52
FI	Availability	Availability			x						x	x	x	x			x	x			x	S58
FI	Availability	Availability	x								x	x	x	x	x	x					x	S60
FI	Availability	Mean queue length (MQL)			x						x		x	x	x	x					x	S30

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio			Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación					
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da			
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.	Ref. Artículo															
FI		User rating					x				x	x	x	x				x		x		x	S51		
FI		Weight by user's preference						x			x	x							x		x		x	S11	
FI	Fault tolerance	Fault Tolerance (FT)						x			x	x			x							x		x	S38
FI	Recoverability	Failure Recovery (FR)					x				x	x			x							x		x	S38
FI	Recoverability	Coverage of Failure Recovery (CFR)		x							x	x			x							x		x	S32
FI	Fault tolerance	Coverage of Fault Tolerance (CFT)		x							x	x			x							x		x	S32
FI	Fault tolerance	Reliability(R)	x	x							x		x		x		x	x				x		x	S05
FI		Reliability(Relws)				x					x	x			x							x		x	S16
FI		Reliability		x							x		x		x			x				x		x	S17
FI		Reliability(RE)			x					x		x	x	x	x				x			x		x	S19
FI		Reliability		x							x	x			x			x				x		x	S32
FI		Reliability of web service			x						x	x			x			x				x		x	S38
FI		Reliability			x						x	x			x	x						x		x	S47
FI		Service reliability	x								x	x		x	x		x	x		x		x		x	S48
FI		Service Accuracy (SA)	x								x	x		x	x		x					x		x	S32
FI		User rating		x							x		x	x	x	x			x			x		x	S51
FI		Weight by user's preference		x							x	x		x	x				x			x		x	S11
FI		Serviceability			x						x	x			x			x				x		x	S47
FI		Reliability of processor			x						x			x	x		x	x		x		x		x	S15
FI		Server reliability			x						x			x	x		x	x		x		x		x	S15
FI		Reliability of Links			x						x			x		x	x	x		x		x		x	S15
FI		System reliability			x						x			x		x	x	x		x		x		x	S15
FI		Defective Operations Per Million attempts (DPM)			x						x	x			x		x	x	x	x		x		x	S64
FI		Reliability		x							x			x	x		x	x		x		x		x	S78
FI	Availability	Availability		x							x			x		x	x	x		x		x		x	S87
FI	Fault tolerance	MTTF			x						x		x	x	x	x	x		x			x		x	S73
SE	Authenticity	Ac_state			x						x		x		x	x						x		x	S74
SE	Authenticity	Authenticity			x						x		x		x	x						x		x	S74
SE	confidentiality	Probability an APT accessed			x						x		x		x	x		x				x		x	S68
SE	Confidentiality	Certification	x	x	x		x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x		x	S78	
SE	Data Integrity	Data Integrity of resource Rk(DI)	x								x	x	x	x	x	x		x				x		x	S36
SE	integrity	Probability the APT detected			x						x		x		x	x		x				x		x	S68
SE	Integrity	Integritymetrics			x						x		x		x	x						x		x	S74

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida										Artefacto software		Tipo de Servicio		Punto de vista						Procedimiento de validación						Ref. Artículo
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica		Validación Empírica		No valida- da					
												A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E	N.V.	P.C.											
SE	integrity	Ac_trans										x		x		x	x										x S74		
SE	Privacy	Privacy										x		x		x	x										x S74		
SE	Security	Security (SECY)										x		x	x	x	x										x S62		
SE	Security	Security (SECY-CQ)										x		x	x	x	x										x S61		
SE	Security	Security Management										x		x	x	x	x		x	x							x S79		
SE	integrity	Data Integrity(DI)										x		x	x	x	x										x S19		
SE		Integrity										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Weight by user's preference										x		x	x				x								x S11		
SE		Number of Fake alarms monitored by Corporate Security										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Number of ineffectual service responses to the issues identified by the Security as control weaknesses										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Number of safety hazards proactively identified										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Percentage of dangerous data resources residing on systems										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Security cost										x		x	x			x									x S47		
SE		Weight by user's preference										x		x	x				x								x S11		
SE		Security index value (Iv)										x		x	x	x	x			x							x S43		
SE		SLA/Security		x	x						x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x						x S71			
SE		secure										x		x	x	x	x										x S74		
SE	integrity	Integrity										x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x							x S74		
SE		Security		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x						x S78			
SE		Security										x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x							x S87		
MA	Analysability	MTTD										x		x	x	x	x	x	x						x		S73		
MA	Analysability	MTTE										x		x	x	x	x	x	x						x		S73		
MA	Modifiability	Mean Time to Change with respect to particular Cloud Service(MTTC)										x		x	x			x								x		S47	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida								Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo		
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida- da	
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.														
MA	Modifiability	Number of dynamic changes in a Cloud service with respect to a workload (Nd)									x		x	x			x					x	S47
MA	Modifiability	Number of static changes in a Cloud service with respect to a workload (Ns)									x		x	x			x					x	S47
MA	Modifiability	Customizability									x		x	x			x					x	S47
MA	Modifiability	Stability		x								x		x	x		x		x			x	S17
MA	Modifiability	Stability(St)									x		x	x			x		x			x	S21
MA	Modifiability	Stabilize rate									x		x	x			x		x			x	S69
MA	Modifiability	Flexibility	x	x							x		x	x	x	x	x		x			x	S66
MA	Modifiability	Stability	x	x							x		x	x	x	x	x		x			x	S66
MA	Modifiability	Flexibility									x		x	x			x		x			x	S79
MA	Reusability	Non Functional Commonality(NFC)		x							x		x	x			x		x			x	S73
MA	Reusability	Functional Commonality(FC)		x							x		x	x			x		x			x	S73
MA	Reusability	Coverage of variability		x							x		x	x			x		x			x	S73
MA		Awarability of Service(AoS)									x		x	x			x					x	S38
MA		Commonality feature(CF)									x		x	x			x					x	S38
MA		Coverage of Variability(CV)		x								x		x	x		x					x	S32
MA		Coverage of Variability(CoV)									x		x	x			x					x	S38
MA		User rating									x		x	x	x	x		x				x	S51
MA		Functional Commonality(FC)		x								x		x	x		x					x	S32
MA		Maintenance reliability									x		x	x	x	x						x	S34
MA		Non-functional Commonality(NFC)		x								x		x	x		x					x	S32
MA		Reusability		x								x		x	x		x					x	S32
MA		Reusability									x		x	x			x					x	S38
MA		Testing time									x		x	x	x		x					x	S47
MA		Understandability of Service (UoS)									x		x	x		x						x	S38
PO	Adaptability	Software Tooling	x	x	x	x	x				x		x	x	x	x	x	x			x	S71	
PO	Elasticity	Under-provisioning(UDPRdt)	x									x		x	x		x		x			x	S01
PO	Elasticity	Over-provisioning(OVPRdt)	x									x		x	x							x	S01
PO	Elasticity	Allocation reactivity(AI)	x									x		x	x	x	x		x			x	S01
PO	Elasticity	Release reactivity(Re)	x									x		x	x	x	x	x				x	S01

Característica	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida						Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo				
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.	Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD	Validación Teórica	Validación Empírica	No valida-dada	
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.														
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity	x	x							x		x		x	x					x	S05	
PO	Elasticity	Mean time taken to expand or contract the service capacity		x							x		x		x							x	S17
PO	Elasticity	Maximum capacity of service		x							x		x		x							x	S17
PO	Elasticity	Reactivity(Ra)		x							x	x			x							x	S21
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity (ELAS-CQ)			x						x	x	x	x	x							x	S61
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity (ELAS)			x						x	x	x	x	x							x	S62
PO	Elasticity	Overprovisioning resource			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Underprovisioning resource			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Average Overprovisioning resource (AVEs)			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Average Underprovisioning resource (AVEd)			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	resource (r)			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	service (s)			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Cost (c)			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity			x						x		x		x	x						x	S70
PO	Elasticity	Cloud elasticity			x						x	x			x	x						x	S67
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	S71	
PO	Elasticity	Agility	x		x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	S82	
PO	Elasticity	Elasticity			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x		x	S78	
PO	Installability	Virtual Systems	x		x	x	x	x			x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	S67	
PO	Installability	Operating systems support	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	S78	
PO	Installability	Platform support	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	S78	
PO	Installability	Virtualization measure	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	S78	
PO	Scalability	Coverage of Scalability	x								x		x		x				x			x	S01
PO	Scalability	Deployment latency	x	x							x		x		x		x	x	x			x	S50
PO	Scalability	Scalability(S)	x								x		x		x		x	x	x			x	S21
PO	Scalability	average delay time at scaling up (AVTu)			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S70
PO	Scalability	average delay time at scaling down (AVTd)			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S70
PO	Scalability	average cost of scaling up (AVCu)			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S70
PO	Scalability	average cost of scaling down (AVCd)			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S70
PO	Scalability	Scalability Time			x						x		x		x	x	x	x	x			x	S67
PO	Scalability	coverage of scalability			x						x	x			x	x	x	x	x			x	S67
PO	Scalability	Scalability			x						x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x		x	S71	
PO	Scalability	Scalability	x		x						x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x			S85	

Característica Calidad	Subcaracterística (interna/externa)	Métrica	Fase del Ciclo de vida								Artefacto software	Tipo de Servicio	Punto de vista				Procedimiento de validación				Ref. Artículo		
			Req.	Adq.	Des.	Int.	Ope.	Ret.	Esp.	Arq.			Ser.	SaaS	PaaS	IaaS	CSP	CSF	CSC	CF	CSD		
			A.A	A.T.M.	E.C.	C.E.	E.	N.V.	P.C.														
PO	Scalability	Scalability						x			x			x	x	x	x					s87	
PO		Adaptability		x							x			x		x						x	s17
PO		Adaptability				x					x	x				x						x	s38
PO		Completeness of variant set(CoM)			x						x	x			x							x	s38
PO		Coverage of Variability(CoV)			x						x	x			x							x	s38
PO		Portability of service			x						x	x			x							x	s47
PO		Coverage of Scalability (COS)		x							x	x			x							x	s32
PO		Coverage of Scalability(CoS)			x						x	x			x							x	s38
PO		Horizontal Cloud scalability		x							x			x		x		x		x		x	s17
PO		Scalability			x						x	x			x		x	x				x	s29
PO		User rating			x						x	x	x	x			x			x		x	s51
PO		Vertical Cloud scalability		x							x			x			x			x		x	s17
PO		Weight by user's preference			x						x	x					x					x	s11